Jenny Uglow on
Johnson & Boswell

The New York Review
of Books

May 23 – June 5, 2019
Volume LXVI, Number 9

DAVID COLE:
The Mueller Report

JONATHAN STEVENSON:
The Trump Emergency

BEN FOUNTAIN:
Billionaire Politics

GAVIN FRANCIS:
The Anti-Vax Epidemic

MOLLY CRABAPPLE:
Sex Workers Rise Up

Giles Harvey on
Olivier Assayas
Resistance to Immunity
Gavin Francis

Calling the Shots: Why Parents Reject Vaccines by Jerome Groopman
New York University Press, 315 pp., $75.00; $20.00 (paper)

Between Hope and Fear: A History of Vaccination and Human Immunity by Michael Kineh
Pegasus, 334 pp., $27.95

The Vaccine Race: Science, Politics, and the Human Costs of Defeating Disease by Meredith Wadman
Viking, 460 pp., $30.00

Not far from the hospital in Edinburgh where I work there’s a graveyard; it can be a calm, if morbid, place after a tough shift. Passing it acts as a memento mori on days when I need to be reminded of the value of medical practice—which for all its modern complexity remains the art of postponing death. Benches are set out in the shade of trees, between red-shingle walkways and rows of Victorian memorial stones. Many of the stones commemorate dead children, but there’s a memorial near the entrance that always stops me short. It’s dedicated toNEWS IN MEDICINE, 1865, at the age of thirty-two—two years before Joseph Lister published his groundbreaking work on antiseptics. The reason for her death is unrecorded. Beneath her own name are listed the names of her six children in their order of death—at ages two, eleven, four, twelve, and fourteen. Only one lived to adulthood.

The death of any child is a tragedy, but to lose so many is now almost unimaginable. In the Victorian period, when infectious diseases were rife, it was routine. I trained in medicine through the 1990s and never saw a case of one of the most virulent, measles, through my tutors would learn about it from their books. Yet we are now in the emergency room recently I saw a girl with a rash, fever, conjunctivitis, swollen lymph glands—all classic symptoms of the measles virus. “Do you know if she has had MMR [measles, mumps, and rubella] vaccine?” I asked her father. He nodded, but something made me doubt his sincerity.

“You are sure?” I asked again.

He nodded, then broke my gaze. “Maybe she skipped that one,” he said at last.

One in twenty children with measles develops pneumonia. Only about one in a thousand develops the most serious complication, encephalitis (a viral inflammation of brain cells). About two in a thousand will die. Having to second-guess parents about whether a patient has been vaccinated is new: physicians and parents are in a constant tug of war for the parents of the children they see—after all, we both want what’s best for the child. But when fears about vaccine safety cause a drop in vaccination, situations of serious infections start rising. Parents who decline to vaccinate their children sense a growing opposition toward their choices. They have a coordinated incentive to lie or, perhaps worse, stay away from the emergency room for fear of having their parenting challenged by medical professionals.

In 2014 Ebola virus examined the crisis of confidence in her book On Immunity: An Inoculation and proposed that we think of infection control as an ecology to be kept in balance rather than a war between opposing sides. Writing with the perspective of a new mother who ultimately chose vaccination for her own child, Biss explored the metaphors we use to think about disease and the body. The word “inoculate” has its origin in the care of gardens and orchards, and was originally used to describe the grafting of a bud onto a tree. It is unfortunate that vaccination has come to be seen as an unnatural and dangerous intervention, when in truth it is’s through “grafting” that the natural power of the recipient’s own immune system is harnessed. The testimony of our graveyard is that before public health, clean water, antiseptics, and vaccination, it was perfectly natural that most children died.

Several recent books by doctors, scientists, and journalists have delved further into the history and science of vaccines and immunity, and the anxieties that accompany them. In Calling the Shots: Why Parents Reject Vaccines, Jennifer Reich, a sociologist who has also written about child protective services, brings mercilessness and sensitivity to this emotional issue. One parent tells Reich that she lies about having vaccinated her children to avoid disapproval from pro-vaccine neighbors; “I think it’s at the point where we need to keep quiet about our health choices if we are not within a like-minded community.” Another sees modern intensive care as a more natural intervention than vaccination, and is reassured by the safety net it provides for some illnesses. Explaining why she has chosen toees, not to whopping cough, vaccination for her children, she tells Reich: “ Territories is the only one that

The story of Dr. Bob Sears of California, notorious for advocating unorthodox schedules of partial vaccination. In 2008 an unvaccinated boy who had picked up measles in Switzerland visited his office. The CDC later confirmed that four children, three of whom were infants below the usual vaccination age, caught measles in Sears’s waiting room. One required hospitalization, while another took a flight to Hawaii, putting all the passengers at risk. (Sears released a statement in which he explicitly confirmed his belief that vaccination can remain optional as long as enough of the wider population continue to get their shots.) Reich hears from Kirk Watson, a pediatrician in Colorado, that she regularly meets parents who won’t register with her until they have checked her clinic’s vaccination rate, saying themselves that her waiting room is a safe place to take their kids.

Distrust of vaccination in the West goes back to its beginnings in the eighteenth century, with the English physician Edward Jenner, but Reich lays out the origins of its latest manifestation, including Reagan-era policy decisions intended to shore up public health (the National Childhood Vaccine Injury Act of 1986), distrust of corporate America, a broadening fear of the ubiquity of environmental toxins, and a declining sense of community responsibility. Some of the other factors she mentions are ones I recognize from my own clinics and consultations in Scotland: the steadily widening disparity between the age of first-time mothers at the top and the bottom of society (mothers who have

The word “vaccine” means “from coves”; it was first used to describe Jenner’s method of preventing smallpox (Latin: variola) in humans by scratching a small amount of fluid from the scabs of a sick in the skin. Smallpox had been killing and mutilating people since it first made the jump to us from rodents between 45,000 and 16,000 years ago; Pharaoh Ramses V is thought to have suffered from it in the twelfth century BCE, and traces have been unearthed from the Indus Valley Civilization. Eighteenth-century Europeans carried it to the Americas, and its lethality is part of the reason that only between 5 and 10 percent of Native American populations—estimated to have survived that encounter.

In China, from about 1000 CE, smallpox scabs were powdered and blown into the nose—a method of inoculation that likely failed smallpox. The Ottomans practiced a modified technique, called “variolation” in the West, in which material from a smallpox scab was introduced under the skin. In 1715 Lady Mary Wortley Montagu, the wife of the British ambassador to Ottoman Turkey, was scarred by smallpox. Fearing for the health of her son, she had him successfully variolated and asked the British embassy surgeon Charles Maitland to observe the procedure. Maitland transmitted the technique to Britain, and smallpox established itself across the Atlantic in Puritan Boston. The clergyman Cotton Mather (the same Mather involved in the Salem witch trials) was an early supporter of variolation. One of his colleagues, Onesimus, had been variolated as a boy among his people. In the early 1720s, threatened with recurrent epidemics of smallpox, Mather arranged with local physicians to variolate 280 Bostonians, of whom only six died of the disease—a significant improvement on the usual fatality rate of one in three.

In England, folk wisdom had noted that milkmaids rarely suffered from smallpox and were able to nurse victims without fear. Prior contact with the virus’s bovine variant, cowpox, appeared to grant protection. During a smallpox epidemic in the late eighteenth century, a Dorset farmer called Edward Jenner was asked by a friend wanting to variolate his family with cowpox rather than smallpox (he’d undergone the latter, but cowpox is milder and less contagious), and Jenner decided to take the opportunity to see if cowpox movement is as old as the techniques it challenges: Mather, seen by some to be contraverring divine or natural law, had a small bomb thrown through his window with a note inscribed, “COTTON-MATHER, you Dog. Damn You: I’ll
The story of smallpox—its malignancy and humanity's triumph over it—is told in Michael Kiehn's Between Hope and Fear: A History of Vaccines and Human Immunity. Kiehn, an immunologist and vaccinologist who has been profoundly alarmed by our current anemia, the "growing forgetfulness of the agonizing and terrifying ailments that have threatened men since immemorial." As a scientist he doesn't hold back in discussing how offensive he finds the "advocacy of false facts by an obstreperous and loud minority that has been energized by a propagandistic campaign passionately committed to its promotion, and who he joined the World Health Organization's program to eradicate pox. "When I meet patients who refuse to give their children the polio vaccine," he said, "I tell them my story. I tell them how important these vaccines are. I tell them to do something foolish like,"

In 1978 a British medical photographer, Janet Parker, became the last person to die of smallpox. She contracted it through the air ducts of a microscope placed in her vaccination chamber, which was situated below her darkroom. The man responsible for the lab, Henry Fleder, committed suicide while at home under quarantine.

Kinch charts the steps through which humanity has come to understand and then defeat (through vaccination) diphtheria, cholera, rubies, and pertussis, or whooping cough—vaccines for which the administrator regularly at my own clinic. I'm lucky enough to have seen the first three diseases in the clinic, but no one now is making a case back as a consequence of dropping vaccination rates.

In Japan in 1947, 20,000 children died from pertussis; by 1972, thanks to vaccination the figure was zero. Then in the winter of 1974–1975 there were two high-profile deaths following administration of the vaccine, and vaccination rates plummeted. By the end of the 1970s the disease had resurged, killing more than forty people a year in Japan. Similar adverse reactions meant that by the United States, Wakefield claimed "no conflict of interest," but he had received more than $50,000 for his expert work on a lawsuit that Barn was putting together against a vaccine manufacturer using alternative vaccines. "It seems that Wakefield was not opposed to vaccines," Kinch observes, "but rather was simply opportunistic. He knew he had not done his intellectual property.

Unvaccinated children may carry disease without symptoms but still spread it among more valuable people in their communities. Vaccination may reduce your child's risk of a disease by 90 percent or more, but if the same person has been unvaccinated, they will not know if they, personally, benefited from it. Adverse reactions to vaccinations are rare, but it takes only a few children to suffer from a public trust to evaporate. The 1952 US polio epidemic infected 58,000 Americans, paralyzing 21,000; Kinch vividly recalls the iron lungs then in widespread use. Polio vaccines were hurriedly generated. In 1954, Salk Laboratories in California manufactured one that contained the Kaposi's sarcoma-associated herpesvirus. More than 100,000 doses are thought to have been produced; 192 people were paralyzed after receiving Salk's vaccine, and ten died. The following year fear of vaccination soared, and polio surged with 25,000 cases.

"People think they distrust vaccinations because they've seen the truth on TV. Documentaries such as W5C-TV's DPT: Vaccine Roulette (1982) bitterly attacked the manufacture of vaccines and even viewers with misinformation hope a spike in ratings. Reagan's intervention fanned the flames of conspiracy theorists, and Wakefield's MMIR study led many to distrust science, as well as the weighing processes of scientific publications. In her book The Vaccines: A People's History and the Human Costs of Defeating Disease, medical reporter Meredith Wadman explores another motivation for the antivaccination movement: the methods by which vaccine companies promote their products.

Viruses do not grow outside living cells; to produce vaccines bulk you need billions upon billions of cells in which to grow the virus. In the book, Wadman visits a factory for rubella vaccine and describes the modern process:

Behind a series of growing rooms and air locks that ensure that those inside air never makes its way in, hooded technicians in white jump-suits and steel-toed shoes with green shoeslaces that rotate slowly, their sides marked by the WI-38 cells growing on them, the medium inside them a to rubella virus.

"Wakefield was struck off the medical register in the UK in 2010 but has continued his campaign against vaccination in the US. He was a guest of one of the TV shows, and the 2014 film "How Disgraced Anti-Vaxxer Andrew Wakefield Was Embraced by Trump's America," The Guardian, July 18, 2015.

In 1974 Otto von Bismarck, outraged by Vichy's liberalism, challenged him to a duel. Vichy agreed on condition that he choose the weapon, and Bismarck chose himself. but a sausage loaded with roundworm larvae for Bismarck. "Germans and their diatoms have continued to relish sausages despite occasional outbreaks of botulism," Kinch adds, dryly, "Arguably, the worst worse poisoning occurred in 1979..."

For his supposed challenge to Bismarck, the great Canadian physician William Osler responded to the anti-vaccinationists of his time in a similar spirit:

I would like to issue a Mount Carmel-like challenge to any ten unvaccinated priests of Baal. I will take five healthy vaccinated persons, and help in the next severe epidemic, with ten selected unvaccinated persons (if available!). I shall invite three members of Parliament, three anti-vaccination doctors, if they could be found, and four anti-vaccination pamphleteers. And I will make this proposition: that I will place both parties to see who will live when they catch the disease, but to look after them as brothers; and for the four or five who are certain to die, I will try to arrange the funerals with all the pomp and ceremony of an anti-vaccination demonstration.

For Kinch, human understanding of disease proceeds by gritty perseverance, flashes of insight, and a great deal of luck. Many are familiar with the discovery of penicillin, when Alexander Fleming inadvertently found its bacterial samples killed by the fungus Penicillium viridicatum. Some viruses are scattered throughout medical history.

The New Review

16

The Cowcock:—"the Wonderful Effects of the New Infusion," detail from James Gillis's cartoon of Dr. Edward Jenner vaccinating patients, 1802. The Cowcock:—"the Wonderful Effects of the New Infusion," detail from James Gillis's cartoon of Dr. Edward Jenner vaccinating patients, 1802.
The Vaccine Race is the story not just of vaccine development but of those WI-38 cells in particular, and it's also a biography of the scientist who developed them, Harald zur Hausen. In the book, Zur Hausen provides readers with a detailed account of his research and the controversies surrounding the use of these cells. The book is a must-read for anyone interested in the history of virology and the development of vaccines.

During the early days of vaccine development, kidney cells from monkeys were used to harvest viruses, because they reproduce readily and can be used to study the spread of viruses. However, these cells are not as flexible as human cells, which can be infected by a wide range of viruses. In contrast, human cells are much more versatile and can be infected by a wide range of viruses.

The Vaccine Race is exhaustive in its account of Harald zur Hausen's professional life and his many conflicts with government agencies and pharmaceutical companies. The book is a fascinating read for anyone interested in the history of virology and the development of vaccines.

Call for 2020–2021 BIOGRAPHY FELLOWS

Application Deadline: January 6, 2020

The Leon Levy Center for Biography invites applications for four 2020–2021 Biography Fellowships and one Leon Levy Alfred F. Sloan Fellow in science biography. Each resident fellow receives a stipend of $72,000, research assistance, writing space and library privileges. They also participate in seminars and the intellectual life of the Graduate Center.

For more information, go to lcbw.gs.cuny.edu.

Applications now open for a new M.A. Program in Biography and Memoir, commencing August 2019:

gc.cuny.edu/bbm

2019–2020 Fellows

Channing Joseph, for a biography of William Dorrance Swann, Abigail Santamaria, for a biography of Madeline L'Engle, David Greenberg, for a biography of John Lewis, Matthew McNelis, for a biography of Albert Murray, Laura J. Snyder, Leon Levy/Alfred F. Sloan Fellow, for a biography of Joseph Stalin.